



# International Journal of Contemporary Educational Research (IJCER)

[www.ijcer.net](http://www.ijcer.net)

## Comparing Preschool Curricula of Turkey and Ohio in the Context of Value Education

Emin Tamer YENEN<sup>1</sup>, Perihan ULUCAN<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Nevşehir Hacı Bektaş Veli University,  
ORCID ID: 0000-0003-2359-3518

<sup>2</sup>Nevşehir Hacı Bektaş Veli University  
ORCID ID: 0000-0003-4778-1804

### Article History

Received: 04.05.2020

Received in revised form: 03.03.2021

Accepted: 16.03.2021

Available online: 03.09.2021

### To cite this article:

Yenen, E. T. & Ulucan, P. (2021). Comparing preschool curricula of Turkey and Ohio in the context of value education. *International Journal of Contemporary Educational Research*, 8(3), 23-38. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.33200/ijcer.732076>

This article may be used for research, teaching, and private study purposes.

Any substantial or systematic reproduction, redistribution, reselling, loan, sub-licensing, systematic supply, or distribution in any form to anyone is expressly forbidden.

Authors alone are responsible for the contents of their articles. The journal owns the copyright of the articles.

The publisher shall not be liable for any loss, actions, claims, proceedings, demand, or costs or damages whatsoever or howsoever caused arising directly or indirectly in connection with or arising out of the use of the research material.

## Comparing Preschool Curricula of Turkey and Ohio in the Context of Values Education \*

Emin Tamer YENEN<sup>1\*</sup>, Perihan ULUCAN<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Nevşehir Hacı Bektaş Veli University

### Abstract

This research has been performed in order to compare the preschool education in Turkey and Ohio early learning standards and the values in the introduction and objective section of both curricula. The study was carried out using document analysis. The data collected in the research covers the Preschool Curriculum of Turkey Ministry of National Education (MNE) 2013 and the Early Learning Standards of the USA, Ohio. The programs of both countries have been accessed through their official websites. In Turkey a single and joint program, prepared by the Ministry of Education, is used in Preschool education. In the state of Ohio, preschool education institutions organize their programs according to common standards. According to the survey, the values about Atatürk and being tidy exist only in the objectives of preschool education program in Turkey. The values of conservation of resources, conservation of natural life, cultural heritage, balance, and creativity are not included in the preschool curriculum objective statements of Turkey but they are integrated in the explanations. However, these values already exist in the Ohio early learning standards. On the other hand the values such as justice, scientific thought, courage, environmental awareness, effective and efficient use of language, discipline, etc. are included in the Ohio early learning standards.

**Key words:** Preschool, Curriculum, Early learning standarts, Values education, Turkey, Ohio

### Introduction

Throughout the human history, numerous and different forms of definitions have been put forth by scientists, rulers, clergy or researchers who have been trying to draw attention to the concept of value, which has been expressed on religious or secular platforms and has numerous discussions, researches or studies. According to Ryan & Bohlin (1999) character is the sum of our intellectual and moral habits. So, the character is a combination of our good habits, virtues and bad habits that make us who we are. These good and bad habits point to us and continuously affect how we react to events and challenges in our lives (Ryan & Bohlin, 1999 p. 9). Rokeach and Regan (1980) defines the value as persistent beliefs that determine whether the consequences of specific behaviors or a specific situation is acceptable for personal or social purposes. In other words, the value is a continuous formation of beliefs related to the preferred style of behavior or the final state of existence. On the other hand, Schwartz (1999) defines the concept of value as beliefs that lead to human behavior, choices or evaluation of these behaviors and choices that are intended to be achieved and that are striving for it.

In the researches carried out in the field, it has been observed that values of education has been approached with different dimensions in different names, such as moral education, personality education, character education, but it has been kept up-to-date in all cultures and societies throughout the history of education. Aristotle's famous saying 'Educating the mind without educating the heart is no education at all' can give insight about the history of values education. Quality education is the education that includes the values education (Lovat & Clement, 2008). In addition to innovations, changes and advantages brought about by technological development; the people of the 21st century are increasingly experiencing various problems related to violence, social problems, lack of respect for each other. For this reason, parents and educators in particular, and usually countries, focus on teaching the values as part of the solution. While humanity benefited from technology in many areas such as transportation, communication, trade, economics education and migration through globalization, different cultures have opened their doors to each other and necessity to live together has arisen for many societies

\* Corresponding Author: *Emin Tamer YENEN, tamer-yenen@hotmail.com*

because of the intensity of their communion. Creating a better world for everyone is at the heart of the educational concern. However, when activities based on raising awareness about values are introduced, students can adopt value-based behaviors and benefit at the highest level when appropriate and effective guidance is provided to discover the values (UNESCO, Living Values Education, 2005).

Values are regarded as teachable and learnable phenomena. However, in the 21st century. The transfer of values to the next generation in the world has been a process in which more difficulties were encountered compared to previous years. While many values adopted and supported by society could be transferred through life in the past, today only experience is not enough. School and family have to take more effort and responsibility than before because the child is exposed to a wide variety of stimuli and forms a system of values by being affected by many factors. It is a social duty not to leave the development of values in children to coincidences and out-of-control mechanisms (Gömleksiz, 2007).

The education system of a society and its institutions and organizations are important units that display the values of that society. As a social institution, the school ensures that social, cultural, universal and social values are transferred to children through educational programs. The school should not only ensure academic success, but also ensure a child to learn about the culture and values of society (Sapsağlam, 2016). It is possible to educate qualified and moral individuals in a society with the education of values given in schools (Aspin, 2000; Halstead & Pike, 2006). Dewey (2013) also stated that schools play an important role in the moral development of children and they should offer opportunities to transform these values into behavior. Schools that reflect ethical values to learning environments contribute to social transformation (Cooper, 2014). Therefore, the acquisition of values in early childhood is important for the continuity of societies. Values education, which is vital for societies, is passed on to the younger generations through the educational programs of the countries. States present their general and specific objectives in educational programs. These goals include many elements from academic skills to culture, values and health. When we look at the main objectives of both countries that are the subject of the research; among the main objectives of the Turkish National Education System preparing students for life in a healthy, happy way and to equipping them with knowledge, skills, values, attitudes, behaviors and habits that will enable them to become good people and good citizens. In this context the objective of values in the education process and transferring to new generations are very important in terms of achieving the goals and cultural continuity (MNE, 2017). On the other hand, the US Department of Education makes the following statements about the type of person who wants to be trained. *“We want our children to develop respect and compassion for others. We want them to be honest, decent and considerate to comply with the law, cooperate with others and act responsibly. We want them to make sound moral choices. The benefits of encouraging the values of the child are great: those who grow stronger, consistent and with positive values are happier, they are better at school, and they are more likely to contribute to society.”* (US Department of Education, 2003).

Given that values education is given in schools from an early age, a comparative study of pre-school education programs in the context of values education will provide an opportunity to look at the values education literature from a perspective that has rarely been studied before. Besides enhancing the wealth of our perspective in the field of values education, this study hopes to ensure that the lack of interest on evaluating pre-school education program on approaches and applications in a holistic manner in the context of values education in Turkey. First of all, it is an important need to determine which approaches are taken as basis in relation to gaining social skills, moral values, attitudes and behaviors in the preschool period in Turkey, questioning and evaluating these approaches and comparing them with the United States, which is a pioneer in values education, in terms of contributing to the field.

In the study, one of the important reason for comparison with the pre-school curricula of Turkey and Ohio, a state from the United States, is the fact that the United States is a country that stands out in values education and has a wide variety of program studies in preschool education. Values education has a rich history in the United States, especially in public schools, in terms of the activities teachers do to build a good character both in lessons and in other activities (Turan, 2014). When we investigate at the history of American education, it is seen that there is an effort to add value, which is expressed with the concepts of moral education first, then values education and character education (Watz, 2011). Today, prepared with the encouragement and support of the federal government character /values education programs have become more prominent and are still compulsory in many states. The multiplicity and diversity of character/values education programs, the freedom provided to states, educational districts and even different schools in the same region, and the competitive attitude supported by state funds increase the wealth in this field (Kesgin, 2015).

Every society has its own unique values. In this context, to educate qualified citizens, values education should be given in schools. Because schools are an indispensable pioneer in teaching values education (Aspin, 2000). In different countries, many programs are implemented under the name of personality training to teach values, starting from pre-school education and continuing within a systematic program. These programs, which are based on the development and learning of the child, bear similarities in terms of both application and content. The values that are tried to be gained with regard to values education constitute the common point of the programs (Pekdoğan, 2017).

In this context, the question of when to start values education has become one of the research areas of values education. Many educators and specialists focus on early childhood. Values develop by benefiting from many sources and the first bases of information about values are formed in this period (Balat & Dağal, 2009; Ogelman & Sarıkaya). Early childhood is a critical period in which the physical, social, emotional, cognitive, psychomotor, language and moral development of a child is the fastest and covers the age range up to the age of seven (Hildebrandt & Zan, 2008; Piaget, 2002). Studies related to the subject state that values education in early childhood has positive effects on children. Trout (2008), in the study examining the effects of values education on children in the pre-school period, found that children five years of age and under had higher scores in understanding, recognizing and converting values compared to children who were educated before the program existed. In general, Preschool education institutions which have traits of being the next step of education in early childhood, have a great responsibility to provide and support the child's cognitive development as well as their social and emotional development. However, this support can be provided by a healthy planning and implementing the teaching of values that direct the attitudes and behaviors. Thus, children who determine the future of societies are not only the future of their family, of their environment and of the society in which they live, but also they are the future of humanity. Therefore, the objective of values from the early years of life will not only result in the development of value, but will also make it an honorable and harmonious member of humanity while developing the child from social emotional aspect (Johansson, et. al. 2014; Recchia & Beck, 2014; Sigurdardottir & Einarsdottir, 2016; Thornberg, 2016).

Curriculum development studies are performed and carried out by the Ministry of National Education in Turkey. In Turkey, the year of 1994 may be regarded as a turning point in the Preschool curriculum development process. Prior to 1994, there was no centralized curriculum that would meet common needs in this field and which had adequate target and target behaviors in terms of the qualifications required in a curriculum. The first draft curriculum in early childhood education was adopted in 1989 and an official Preschool education program was prepared for the first time in 1994. In line with changing needs and developments, Preschool education programs were developed in 2002 and 2006. Preschool education programs prepared in 1994, 2002 and 2006 were organized in accordance with the age of children and their developmental characteristics. (Dilek, 2017; Gelişli & Yazıcı, 2012, Kandır, Özbey & İnal, 2010; MNE,1994). Within the scope of the project of strengthening preschool education with the data obtained from national and international scientific researches and evaluation processes of the program, various arrangements were made in the Preschool education program in 2012 and pilot applications were introduced in the same year. In the 2013-2014 school year, it was generalised across the country (MNE, 2013). There is no separate section or practice on values education in preschool programs. However, values such as love, respect, cooperation, responsibility, tolerance, solidarity and sharing are among the basic principles of preschool education. In 2013, the program included the title 'taking into consideration cultural and universal values', and the expression "*Values are not considered as a separate field of education in the program, but they are emphasized in the gains and indicators in an holistic way*" was stated as a special emphasis on values education (MNE, 2013, p. 17).

In the United States, Early Childhood Education programs are not central. Each state establishes and implements its own educational standards. However, there is an organization called the National Association for the Education of Young Children, which studies on common standards and is widely accepted throughout the country. National Association for the Education of Young Children is a non-profit private organization. It is not funded by the government. It is a professional member body that proposes standards for the field. It also provides accreditation for child development education programs and higher education programs that train teachers. Some states have mandated NAEYC accreditation for teacher-training undergraduate programs of universities. Accreditation of the institution for many child development programs is a way to ensure that these candidate parents are of high quality. This organization provides unity between research, policies and practices to encourage all children, who are 0-8 years old, to receive high quality education. It also supports the development of various dynamics related to the early childhood profession and anyone who gives service educate or works for children. In addition, the organization carries out the world's largest conference on early childhood education every year (NAEYC, 2018).

The Ohio State Department of Education in the United States of America launches the vision of early childhood education as 'All children are precious, healthy and happy'. The same unit also expresses its objectives that children have high quality education and care and environment, they have service and support for their comprehensive healthy development and families have meaningful community and parent support. On the web page of the early learning department, there are also a number of resources designed for all share holder to meet all public needs (Early Childhood Ohio, 2017).

In 2007, the School Readiness Solutions Group published a book entitled "Giving children a chance: Ohio School Readiness practice strategies," which contains the key principles of the Ohio Early Childhood System. These principles are based on responding to children's versatile and healthy development. In order to achieve this, the support to be given to families starting from the prenatal period, the role of the government and institutions are summarized and the importance of equality, sustainability and high quality is emphasized in all services to be provided (Early Childhood Ohio, 2017).

As it can be seen, both nations want new generations to have values and begin values education as early as possible. In Turkey as in the whole world, the importance of early childhood education is increasingly better understood. However, the socio-economic and political changes in the country affected this area as well as all other areas, and delays were experienced in the renovation and development works. Research on children in pre-school period, their parents and teachers and values education needs to be increased and expanded in Turkey (Ogelman and Sarikaya, 2015). Acquiring the values of abstract concepts to preschool children requires a well-organized structure considering their developmental characteristics. For this reason, it is of great importance to examine how the elements related to values education are included in educational programs. In addition, the results of several small-scale studies conducted by various researchers document that pre-primary education contributes to better education, professional and social outcomes for disadvantaged children in the long term as well as children with normal opportunities and developmental characteristics, and is cost-effective. However, the results of large-scale, long-term studies also indicate that early childhood education positively affects the economic success and health status of individuals over the following year (Melhuish, 2011; Reynolds et al., 2011). When examined the literature, various comparative researches about values education were found (Bursa & Çengelci-Köse, 2017; Dede, 2014; Harlin & Morgan, 2009; Thornberg & Oğuz 2013). On the other hand, in the related literature, any various comparative research about Preschool programs / standards between Turkey and Ohio were not found. It is thought that the evaluation of the values in early childhood education standards in a different country in the context of values education in comparison with the Preschool education program in Turkey will contribute to the literature. In addition, it is thought that determining how values education is applied in pre-school education programs comparatively, determining the problems encountered in the teaching process and making suggestions for the development of applications will contribute to the field. This research is limited to examining the pre-school education programs of two countries. The data in the research is limited to written sources; reports, official documents, official websites, books and article obtained in the state of Ohio, where is one of the researchers was on duty on about TUBITAK project named values education in pre-school, and simultaneously obtained in Turkey.

The purpose of this research is to compare the values in the introductory and objectives chapter of early childhood education program and standards applied in Turkey and Ohio. For this purpose, the following questions were asked:

- Which values have been included in the introductory chapter of the Preschool education programs of the Ministry of National Education in Turkey since 2013?
- Which values have been included in the introductory chapter of Early Learning Standards in Ohio since 2012?
- Which values reflected on the objectives of the 2013 preschool curriculum of Turkey?
- Which values reflected on the early learning standards in Ohio?
- What are the similarities and differences in terms of values presented in early learning educational programs/standards in Turkey and Ohio?

## **Method**

### **Research Design**

This study was carried out within the framework of a qualitative research approach. Document analysis method, one of the qualitative research methods, was used in this study. The examination of the document covers the

analysis of written materials that contain information about the targeted cases or cases intended to be analyzed. It can be used as a research pattern as well as a data collection technique (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2006, p. 187).

Descriptive analysis was used to obtain data, as the unit of analysis, the basic concepts that express the values and the objective phrases/standards that express values are based on. The programs/standards of both countries have been reached through official websites. Values in curricula of Turkey and Ohio related pre-school education were examined the scope and purpose of the study and survey data were classified separately for both countries, edited, interpreted by determining similar and different aspects. In this context;

- First of all, the target groups (student groups) in the pre-school education programs of both countries were determined in the research.
- Development areas in the programs were compared.
- Topics included in the pre-school education programs of both countries were introduced.
- Then, in the findings section, the values in the programs of both countries were presented in separate tables.
- Finally, similarities and differences regarding the values included in the programs of both countries were explained.

In the study, programs and explanations were carefully read and gains about values were determined separately by both researchers in order to increase internal validity and to prevent the reflection of the observers' prejudices on the research. The data obtained by the researchers were compared in terms of consistency. In addition, the results were evaluated and compliance was checked by an independent researcher. After the consistency and compliance checks the data were shown to three field experts; one of whom is in the department of basic education and has works on values education, one of whom is in English department and the other one is a pre-school education expert. As a result of the controls, the names of some values that cause misconceptions were changed.

In order to increase the reliability of the study, it was explained in detail how the study was designed and conducted. The data obtained from official programs were categorized and under which headings the values were examined. The method of the research, the sources of data collection, how the study was analyzed, and what kind of stages in the study were explained. The data obtained in the study were presented to the reader in a descriptive manner without any comments.

### **Data Sources**

The data collected in the study cover the Turkey MNE 2013 Preschool Curriculum and the Early Learning Standards of the USA Ohio. The data presented in the study are written sources such as; reports, official documents, official websites, books and article obtained in the state of Ohio and Turkey. One of the important reasons for choosing Ohio State in the study is that one of the researchers has been to Ohio within the scope of the TÜBİTAK project named values education in pre-school. The values in the education programs/standards applied in Turkey and Ohio Preschool education institutions were analyzed with the dimensions of "introduction and objectives/standards". Ohio State Early Childhood Education does not include a single program, consists of a multi-faceted and multi-participating system. It has different structure from the one and common program approach applied in Turkey. For this reason, in the analysis of the data, an approach which is appropriate to both programs has been adopted and it has been tried to be handled systematically within itself. In this study, the introductory chapter of the MNE 2013 education program implemented in Turkey includes general aims of national education, principles and characteristics of preschool education. On the other hand, early childhood care and services are organized in accordance with the common standards of many organizations working in coordination in Ohio State. Therefore, it differs according to its structure. For this reason, in the analysis of MNE 2013 education program, the understanding of creating a systematic within itself and in the analysis of Ohio early childhood education standards, the understanding of creating a systematic within itself was adopted.

MNE 2013 preschool education program was prepared for 36-72 months old (age of 3-6) children and the definition of this age group was made as "Child". Development areas were separated in the program and age groups were defined as 36-48 months old children, 48-60 months old children and 60-72 months old children in each development area. Despite the fact that the behavioral examples of these age group were included in each area of development, a common understanding was adopted in their achievements and indicators. The target group of the MNE 2013 Preschool Education program includes 60-72 months old children, so 6 years old children, who are not included in the research. There is no program for children younger than 36 months. Therefore, the data were analysed through common objectives.

In the state of Ohio, infancy- childhood periods have been named. In early learning standards; the term infant is used for individuals up to 8 months, the term Young Toddlers for which there is no term in Turkish is used for the period between 6-18 months of infant and child and the term Older Toddlers is used for the period between 16-36 months. Standards are prepared for children from birth to 60 months age. The target groups of the programs and standards subject to document analysis which are within the scope of the research are given in the table below

Table 1. Target groups of programs and standards included in the scope of research.

Preschool Curriculum of Turkey			Ohio Early learning standards		
Target group	Definition	Scope of the Research	Target group	Definition	Scope of the Research
			Birth-8 months	Infant	-
			6-18 months	Young Toddlers	-
			16-36 months	Older Toddlers	-
36-48 Months	Child	+	3-5 years old	Pre-kindergarten	+
48-60 months	Child	+	3-5 years old	Pre-kindergarten	+
60-72 months	Child	-			

### Data Collection and Analysis

Research data were obtained by document analysis method. Program instructions and official documents constituted the data source in the related research. In this respect, MNE 2013 preschool education program and the early childhood education program implemented in Ohio obtained from official ministry website as a source of data. Before the findings section, the areas of development covered in the programs were compared and topics included in the pre-school education programs of both countries were introduced.

The preschool programs that are implemented in Turkey and Ohio show various similarities and differences. The main difference is that while there is only one program implemented by the Ministry of National Education in Turkey, common standards that were created jointly by all partners that provide education and care in the framework of early childhood education services are used in Ohio.

The basic similarity is that the areas of development in the program content are expressed very close to each other. The areas of development in the programs that are implemented in Turkey and Ohio are shown in the table below.

Table 2. The areas of development covered in the programs

Turkey	Ohio
Language Development	Approaches to Learning
Social and Emotional Development	Cognitive Development and General Knowledge
Motor Development	Language and Literacy
Self-care Skills	Social and Emotional Development
Cognitive Development	Physical Health and Motor Development

There are five areas of development in preschool program in Turkey: Cognitive development, language development, social and emotional development, motor development, and self-care skills. In Ohio, on the other hand, learning approaches are considered as a separate area. Other areas are cognitive development, general knowledge, language and literacy, social and emotional development, and physical health and motor development.

### Preschool Curriculum Implemented in Turkey

In preschool education in Turkey, a single and a joint program prepared by the Ministry of National Education is implemented. The Ministry of National Education 2013 Preschool Education Program is based on the "Preschool Education Program for Children of 36-72 Months", which was implemented to be developed in 2006. Within the scope of Empowering Preschool Education project, status analyses were made, as a result of feedback from various researches and implementations at the national and international level, a program development study was conducted once again in 2012 and 2013 school years. The program aims to promote healthy growth and self-care of children and to prepare them for elementary school by supporting all developmental areas of children. Thus, the program provides for the children's gaining of rich learning experiences. In preparation of the program, the developmental characteristics and needs of children were taken

into consideration, environmental conditions were reviewed and the program was decided to be a progressive one. At the same time, the program is in a spiral and an eclectic structure (MNE, 2013).

The program that is being implemented in all preschools throughout Turkey, consists of six chapters apart from the presentation part. In this study, the findings have been analyzed under four main headings. The aspects that have been evaluated regarding the content analysis of the values are shown in the table below.

Table 3. Chapters of the Ministry of National Education 2013 Preschool Curriculum Implemented in Turkey

Chapters of the curriculum to be evaluated in this study	Chapters of the Preschool Curriculum
<b>Introduction</b>	Presentation
	General Purposes of Turkish National Education
	Objectives of Preschool Education
	Basic Principles of Preschool Education
	1. The Importance of Preschool Period
<b>Objectives</b>	1.1. The Importance of the Family
	1.2. The Importance of Teachers
<b>Learning Process</b>	2. Introducing the Preschool Education Program
	Developmental Characteristics, Objectives and their Indicators
	Planning and Implementation of Preschool Education
	4.1. Preschool Education Environment and Learning Centers
	4.2. Activity Types and their Descriptions
<b>Evaluation</b>	4.3. Monthly Education Plan
	4.4. Daily Education Flow
	5. Evaluation of Preschool Education
	5.1. Evaluation of Children
	5.2. Evaluation of the Program
	5.3. Self-Evaluation of the Teacher

In this study, the chapter to be discussed as "Introduction" in document analysis covers the chapters of Presentation, The General Purposes of Turkish National Education, The Purposes of the Preschool Education, The Basic Principles of the Preschool Education, The Importance of Preschool Period, and the Introduction to the Program of the Preschool Education. The chapter on Objectives covers The Developmental Characteristics, Objectives, and their Indicators.

### The Early Childhood Education Program Implemented in Ohio

Every State in the United States is implementing its own program. In the State of Ohio where the study was conducted, the early childhood education institutes regulate their programs according to the common standards. These standards were widened by the joint work of Ohio Department of Education, Ohio Department of Job and Family Services, Ohio Department of Health, Ohio Department of Mental Health and Addiction Services, Ohio Department of Developmental Disabilities, Ohio State Office of Health Transformation and were acknowledged by all institutions that provide children care and education services to those who are in the period from birth till kindergarten as of 9th of October, 2012. Even though preschool institutions adopt a different program, they regulate their program according to these standards (Early Childhood Ohio, 2018). The schema regarding standards in question is shown in the table below.

Table 4. Standards of the Early Childhood Education in Ohio

Relevant Area	Strand	Topic
Social and emotional development area	The concept of self	Recognition and expression of emotions, The concept of self, sense of self-comfort, self-regulation, self-competency
	Relationships	Bonding, interaction with peers and adults, communication and empathy



Physical Health and Motor Development	Self-care, applications Physical health	safety	Large muscles: balance and coordination, Small muscles: touching, gripping, reaching, changing, mouth movements Being aware of the body, physical activity, nutrition, self-care, safety applications
Approaches to learning	Entrepreneurship Responsibility and persistence Creativity	and	Entrepreneurship and curiosity, planning, action, and reflection Caution, persistence Innovation and discovery, Expressing ideas and emotions through art
Language and literacy development	Listening and speaking Reading Writing	and	Objective of language clearly, narration, social communication Early reading, reading comprehension, fluency, writing, concept, phonological awareness, recognition of letters and words Early writing, writing process, writing applications and composition
Cognitive development and general knowledge	Cognitive Skills Mathematics Social work Science		Symbolic thinking, reasoning, and problem-solving The perception of numbers / Number relations and operations / Algebra (Grouping and classification, modeling) / Assessment and data/ Geometry The concept of self (Social identity) / History (Historical thinking and skills, cultural heritage) / Geography (Spatial thinking skills) / Government-Management (Citizenship skills, rules, and laws) / Economics (Scarcity, production and consumption) Scientific inquiry and application / Earth and space science / Scientific physics (Energy) / Biology (Exploring the world of living things)

As can be understood from the table, each development area is divided into strands (main branches) and each main branch is subdivided. The area of social and emotional development consists of the main branches of self and relationships, learning approaches consists of entrepreneurship, responsibility and persistence, creativity, physical health and motor development consists of self-care skills, safety, assessment and data practices, physical health, cognitive development and general knowledge; cognitive skills, mathematics, social studies and science. Language and literacy development area consists of the main branches of listening and speaking, reading, writing.

## Results

### The Values in the "Introduction" chapter in 2013 Preschool Curriculum of the Turkey

In this study, the chapters under the titles of "General Objectives of Turkish National Education, Objectives of Preschool Education, General Principles of Preschool Education, The Importance of Preschool Period, The Importance of the Family, The Importance of the Teacher, Introduction to Preschool Education Program" are named "Introduction" in the 2013 Preschool Education Program of the Ministry of National Education.

The emphasized values in this chapter are summarized in Table 5.

Table 5. The values stated in the "introduction" chapter in 2013 preschool curriculum of Turkey

Introduction	Value expressions
General Objectives of Turkish National Education,	Atatürk's nationalism; national, moral, humanitarian, spiritual and cultural values; love of family, country and nation; duty and responsibility towards the Republic of Turkey, healthy personality and character, respect for human rights, social responsibility
Objectives of Preschool Education	Gaining good habits, speaking Turkish correctly and beautifully

Basic Principles of Preschool Education	Understanding of democratic education, speaking Turkish correctly and beautifully, love, respect, cooperation, responsibility, tolerance, mutualisation, solidarity and sharing, self-confidence, self-respect, self-control
The Importance of Preschool Period (The importance of the family, the importance of teachers)	Ability to develop positive attitudes towards learning, self-worth and self-competence, Appreciation, love, trust
Introduction of the Preschool Education Program	Cultural and universal values, respect for diversity, coexistence in harmony

The general objective of Turkish National Education is expressed under four articles. These articles underline what type of citizenship the Republic of Turkey wants. These values are directly emphasized in these articles. The general objectives of preschool education cover children's cognitive and emotional development, speaking Turkish correctly and beautifully, and forming good habits. The Article 7 (MNE, 2013) within the basic principles of preschool education, gives direct place to the values as follows: *"With the education given in preschool period, children's feelings and behaviors like love, respect, cooperation, responsibility, tolerance, mutualisation, solidarity, and sharing should be developed. Education should ensure that the child respects and trusts himself and should bring him or her self-control."* In addition, it is emphasized again and again that correct and beautiful speaking of Turkish and that education must be provided within the understanding of democratic education. In the chapter on the importance of preschool education, family values such as close, warm and sensitive relations, and trust are emphasized in order to ensure social harmony and success and it is expressed that children who grow up in a family environment where values are experienced will have values such as social competence, self-worth, and self-competence. Values of love and trust must come to the forefront in the relationship between the teacher and the child. It is stated that *"It is important for children to recognize the values of the society they live in, to adopt the cultural and universal values in the aspect of being raised as individuals who have the sense of responsibility."* under the title of *"Considers Cultural and Universal Values"* of the introduction chapter of preschool education program. In this way, the program encourages respect for diversity and gaining experience in living together in harmony with individuals with different characteristics. In the program, it is expressed that values education is not considered as a separate field, but the objectives and their indicators are emphasized in a holistic manner. Therefore, the preschool program does not directly cover the objective, the activity, and the evaluation processes of values education. Since the program is emphasized in a holistic way, it is necessary to make inferences about the values.

### The Values Stated in the Introduction Chapter of the Early Childhood Education Standards in the State of Ohio

The Ohio state early childhood education does not include a single program; on the contrary, it is a multi-faceted and highly participatory system. For this reason, it has a different structure than the one and common program concept applied in Turkey. Each development area is treated separately but with a holistic approach in teacher's guides that cover the standards for each development area and the application of these standards. This is why a special section that can be defined as "Introduction" does not exist. However, there is a brief introductory chapter to the introduction of the standards. At the beginning of each development area, there is a general description of the area. The parts of these descriptions that can be related to the values are summarized in the table below.

Table 6. The values stated in the introduction chapter of the early childhood education standards in the State of Ohio

Development Areas	The Values
Social and emotional development	<b>Objective:</b> Successfully building social worlds, developing positive relationships with peers and adults <b>Focus:</b> Studies related to improving children's ability to handle attention, emotions, and behaviors
Physical Health and Motor Development	<b>Objective:</b> Children's development of a healthylifestyle <b>Focus:</b> Gaining healthy habits, self-help, healthy nutrition, being physically well by developing the body in an effective and efficient way in daily life practices
Approaches to learning	<b>Objective:</b> Improving children's goal settings for themselves, planning,

	and objective skills by allowing them to utilize opportunities at the highest level and empowering children's social interactions <b>Focus:</b> Entrepreneurship, curiosity, motivation for coping with difficulties, the underlying attitudes and tendencies towards the experiences of social interaction and learning <b>Objective:</b> Communicating effectively with their peers and adults,
Language and literacy	<b>Focus:</b> Improving the skills of children of using the language effectively and efficiently for expressing themselves
Cognitive development and general knowledge	<b>Objective:</b> Developing cognitive processes for learning in other areas, acquiring information about the social and physical world <b>Focus:</b> Mathematics, social studies, science

In the introduction, there is a brief description of each area separately, each area's objective and focus are summarized by providing justification. It also covers the objective of the emotional area as it supports all development areas in a multifaceted way by not using direct value expressions. On the other hand, in the introduction part, it is explained with various examples that language development is not independent of cognitive development and that physical development is not independent of social and emotional development, thus providing the fact that an area cannot be limited to only itself. So, the introducing part of the standards develops a general point of view towards children's knowledge, skills, attitudes, and behaviors of all development areas.

### Values Reflected on the Objectives of the 2013 Preschool Education Program of the Ministry of National Education

Table 7. Values reflected on the objectives of the 2013 preschool curriculum of Turkey

Development areas	Objectives	Relatable Values
Language Development	Uses attentive words in his/her speech.	Kindness
Social and Emotional Development	Waits for his/her turn to talk.	Respect
	Expresses himself/herself in creative ways.	Scientificity
	Expresses someone else's feelings towards an event or a situation.	Altruizm
	Expresses his/her positive or negative feelings in a proper way towards an event or a situation.	Acts positively
	Defends his/her and others' rights.	Human rights
	Motivates himself/herself to accomplish a job or a task.	Ambition
	Respects diversity.	Respect for diversity
	Describes different cultural features.	Responsibility
	Fulfills responsibilities.	Responsible
	Takes responsibility for Atatürk-related activities.	consumption, Resource conservation
	Complies with the rules in environments.	Atatürk
	Maintains aesthetic values.	Compliance with the rules
	Recognizes the value of works of art.	Aesthetics
	Self-confident.	Self-confidence
	Explains that individuals have different roles and duties in social life.	The rules of social life
	Solves his/her problems with others.	Peace, Reconciliation
Self-care skills	Employs the rules about self-cleaning.	Cleanliness
	Makes the necessary arrangements in the living quarters.	Regularity
	Has an adequate and balanced diet.	Healthy nutrition
	Protects himself/herself from dangers and accidents.	Safety
	Takes health-related measures.	Healthcare

According to the information shown in Table 6, the objectives that can be directly relatable to the values stated in the 2013 Preschool Education Program of the Ministry of National Education fall into three development areas. These development areas are language, social and emotional development, and self-care skills. The objectives that can be related directly to the values fall densely within the field of social and emotional development with 14 objectives. These objectives can be relatable to twelve objectives. In the area of self-care skills, there are five objectives directed to the values. These can be relatable to five values. There are two

objectives directed to the values in the area of language development, and these can be related to the values of kindness and respect.

Table 8. The values reflected on the early learning standards in Ohio

Main branch	Subject	Values
Self	Recognition and expression of emotions, Self-regulation The understanding of competence	Self-worth, Altruism, Patience, Responsibility, Self-confidence
Relationships	Bonding, Interaction with adults Interaction and communication with peers, Empathy	Love, Respect and obedience, Cooperation, Reconciliation, Altruism
Motor Development	Large muscles: balance and coordination Sensory-motor	Balance
Physical health	Physical movements, Nutrition, Self-care Safety applications	Being gameful, Safety, Healthy nutrition, Cleanliness, Healthcare
Entrepreneurship	Entrepreneurship and curiosity,	Courage, Curiosity
Responsibility and persistence Creativity	Caution, persistence Innovation and discovery Expressing ideas and emotions through art	Responsibility, Ambition, Persistence, Discipline Scientificity, Innovativeness, Entrepreneurship, Appreciation, Aesthetics
Listening and speaking	Objective of language clearly, narration, social communication	The rules of social life, Kindness, Friendliness, Usage of language effectively and efficiently
History	Historical thinking and skills, cultural heritage	Cultural heritage
Geography	Human systems	Respect for diversity, Human rights and responsibilities
Government (Management)	Citizenship skills, Rules and laws	Cooperation, Justice, Reconciliation, Compliance with the rules, Respect for laws
Economics	Scarcity, production, and consumption	Opinion, Preserving sources, Consumption responsibility
Scientific inquiry and application	Questioning, cause, and effect	Scientific thought
Earth and space science	Exploring the natural world	Being productive
Biology	Exploring the world of living things	Respect for natural life, Nature conservation, Environmental awareness

Objectives that can be associated with Ohio Early Learning Standards directly, fall into all development areas. There are 16 values that can be associated with the 19 objectives in the cognitive development and general knowledge development areas, 9 values that can be associated with 10 objectives in the social and emotional development area, 6 values that can be associated with 8 objectives in the physical health and motor development areas, 10 values that can be associated with 11 objectives in the approaches to learning development area, 3 values that can be associated with 3 objectives in the language and literacy development area.

Table 9. Similarities and differences regarding the values included in the programs of Turkey and Ohio

	Values in Turkey	Values in Ohio
Similarities	Peace	Peace
	Altruizm	Altruizm
	Aesthetics	Aesthetics
	Respect for diversity	Respect for diversity
	Human rights and responsibilities	Human rights and responsibilities
	Compliance with rules	Compliance with rules
	Kindness	Kindness
	Positive Behavior	Positive Behavior
	Healthy nutrition	Healthy nutrition
	Respect	Respect
	Responsibility	Responsibility
	Self confidence	Self confidence
	Cleanliness	Cleanliness
	Reconciliation	Reconciliation
	Safety	Safety
	Consumption responsibility	Consumption responsibility
Preserving sources	Preserving sources	
Differences	Atatürk's nationality	Self respect
	Regularity	Nature conservation
		Cultural heritage
		Balance
		Scientificity
		Justice
		Entrepreneurship
	Patience	
	Autonomy	

The values of determination, peace, altruizm, aesthetics, respect for diversity, human rights and responsibilities, compliance with rules, kindness, positive behavior, health, healthy nutrition, respect, responsibility, self-confidence, cleanliness, reconciliation, safety, consumption responsibility, preserving sources are found in objectives of both countries' preschool education program while the values of Atatürk's nationality and regularity are found only in the objectives of Turkey's implemented preschool education program. The objectives of self respect, nature conservation, cultural heritage, balance, scientificity, justice, entrepreneurship, autonomy and patience are not clearly stated in the Turkish preschool education program but are stated in the descriptions. However, these values are directly stated in Ohio Early Learning Standards.

## Conclusion and Discussion

The education of the values corresponds to the development of the ability of the students to assume their responsibilities in general framework, to make the right choices, to improve the quality of the society they live in, to be happy, peaceful, harmonious, and to develop the knowledge, skills, attitudes and behaviors that enable them to live in the body and mind health as individuals. (Aydın and Akyol Gürler, 2013; Berman, 1998; Cüceloğlu, 1998; Çetingöz, 2015; Elias, 2009; Lickona, 1996; Ryan and Bohlin, 1999; Schwartz, 2007).

The aim of the research is to compare the values in the introduction and objectives chapter of early childhood education program and standards applied in Turkey and Ohio. In accordance with the main aim the similarities and differences in terms of values presented in early learning educational programs/standards in Turkey and Ohio were revealed in the study. Preschool curricula of both countries include various values. However, the Preschool/early learning programme/standards implemented in both countries show a variety of differences and similarities in terms of structure and content. Structural differences in pre-school education in the country is the use of Turkey as a single and a joint program prepared by the Ministry of Education in general. On the other hand, in the United States, each state implements its own standards. In Ohio State where the study is carried out, even if preschool education institutions adopt a different approach to education program, they regulate their practices according to the common standards adopted by all shareholders. All documents related to standards and practices are published on the early Childhood Ohio official website (Early Childhood Ohio, 2018).

In the content of the preschool education program in Turkey, includes five different developmental areas. These are expressed as Cognitive development, Language Development, Social and Emotional Development, Motor development, Self-care skills. In Ohio, it is considered as a separate area. Other areas that are cognitive development and general knowledge, language and literacy, social and emotional development, physical health and motor development and approaches to learning. Each development area is divided into strands (main branches) and each branch is divided into sub-branches.

In the context of values indicated in the programs it is clearly understood that the values show diversity. Besides the universal common values of both countries such as peace, kindness, respect..., there are also some national values that they take attention. For example in the U.S. Ohio self respect, autonomy, nature conservation, cultural heritage etc. stand out as national values, while in Turkey Atatürk's nationality and regularity are presented as national values. A classification was made concerning the values in Turkey by Acat and Aslan (2012). The Public and National values in this classification are expressed as patriotism, secularism, nationalism, ownership of Turkish culture, sensitivity to national symbols and reformism/revolutionism. On the other hand, Bacanlı (2011) argues that the national values are formed by common preferences and desires of individuals who form a society and a culture. The main emphasis here is the common nature of the shares. So individuals share common values. Therefore, the transfer of value to the next generation is the transfer of common values and preferences. A table of values belonging to various nations has been created by Ekşi and Katılmış (2011). In this table, Turkish national values are listed as being fairness, independence, peace, scientific, hardworking, solidarity, sensitivity, honesty, equality, tolerance, freedom, respect, love, hospitality, responsibility, cleanliness, patriotism, importance of being healthy and caring for family unity. So, it can be said that in the introduction chapter of the Preschool education program of the Ministry of National Education, all national values are emphasized.

Each field of development has been handled separately but with a holistic approach in the documentation of Early Learning Standards applied in Ohio State and teacher guidance on the implementation of these standards. Therefore, there is no special chapter that can be defined as "introduction". However, there is a brief introduction to the introducing of standards. At the beginning of each development area there are general explanations on that area. In the explanations, development areas are introduced and they are summarized in which direction these areas focus. This section does not contain direct value expressions, but it supports all development areas in a versatile way. In this section, it is explained by various examples that no field is independent from each other. The introduction chapter of Ohio early learning standards provides an overview of the children's knowledge skills attitudes and behaviors of all areas of development.

This perspective supports the general character education of the United States. The US Department of education website states that the program for character education in American schools began in the 1840s. It explains that it adopted a common understanding of character education in 1994, it renewed this understanding with the slogan of No Child Left Behind and with the law enacted and expanded the support for Character Education in 2001 It also points out that one of the six goals of the US Ministry of Education is to promote strong character and citizenship among the youth of the Nation. The United States draws attention to the fact that the way children are a responsible citizen is through having a strong character and emphasizes national values when defining a strong character. The US Department of education refers to people with strong characters who are compassionate, honest and fair, set goals and meet, good judgment, respect others, respect and protect the beliefs, have a strong sense of responsibility, citizens who are concerned about their communities, protect self respecting (US Department of Education,2018). In the list made by Ekşi and Katılmış (2011), The United States national values are included as liberty, privacy, the rule of law, human dignity, justice, loyalty, international human rights, equality, responsibility, honesty, diversity, respect for authority.

It can be said that the values of the objectives in the MNE 2013 preschool education program can be associated directly with the language, social and emotional development areas and with the development areas of self-care skills. On the other hand, the values of the objectives in Ohio Early Learning Standards can be associated with the development areas of the whole. According to the results of the research, peace, altruizm, aesthetics, respect for diversity, human rights and responsibilities, compliance with rules, kindness, positive behavior, health, healthy nutrition, respect, responsibility, self-confidence, cleanliness, reconciliation, safety, consumption responsibility, preserving sources were presented in both countries' programs. While the values of Atatürk's nationality and regularity were reflected only in Turkey, values of self respect, nature conservation, cultural heritage, balance, scientificity, justice, entrepreneurship and patience were only stated in Ohio. What is noteworthy here is that, unlike Turkish curriculum, the diversity of values is striking in the programs in Ohio.

Research shows that the values of whole humanity around the world are common unchanging and rooted. These values are classified in many different ways. Universal values which are common are constants. They don't change. In most of the studies carried out on the subject, values such as love, respect, responsibility, fairness, caring, tolerance, honesty and sharing take the first place (Akin, 1995; Gürhan, 2017; Josephson & Hanson, 2002; Komalasari & Saripudin, 2017; Lickona 1991; Schwartz, 2012; Zajda, 2009). Many countries have received values education in their curricula. When the values of these countries are examined, it is seen that values such as truth, love, freedom, equality, justice, respect for oneself and others, responsibility and being peaceful are common (Doğanay 2007). Universal values and countries' common values are largely parallel. However, it is not enough to teach these values theoretically; individuals should be able to demonstrate knowledge, skills and attitudes that they can use in daily life (Fixler 2000). Therefore, in addition to the values that need to be taught, it is of great importance what kind of approaches teachers follow in passing on values to new generations. Values education in Turkey has undergone different stages. The values education was sometimes taught as a separate course and sometimes it was tried to be given to the students in other courses. On the other hand, it is observed that Ohio State Early Learning standards are very rich and explanatory in terms of reflecting values.

## Recommendations

In this study preschool education programs in Turkey and Ohio were compared to in the context of values education. When the preschool education programs of both countries are examined, it is striking that there are more development areas in the preschool education program in Ohio. In this context, the values given to the students along with the universal value has been determined to be more than that of Turkey. In line with the results of the research the following suggestions can be given for the implementation of values education in pre-school education:

- It can be advised to offer a wider range of values education by expanding development areas in Turkey's pre-school education program.
- It is understood that national values such as Atatürk's nationality and regularity and classical universal values such as peace, respect and cleanliness are emphasized in pre-school education program in Turkey. In addition to these, values for the individual's self-development such as self-esteem, autonomy and entrepreneurship should be included and expanded as in the program in Ohio.
- Considering that values are abstract concepts and difficult to acquire in this age group, concrete experiences can be included in in-school and out-of-school activities in the programs.
- In the pre-school education program, concrete and fun activities in accordance with the development and cognitive characteristics of children about values education can be increased.

For further studies:

- Pre-school education programs of different countries can be compared in different contexts or in the context of values education.
- Values education practices in different countries can be examined with survey, interview and observation techniques.
- The relationship between perceptions of values with different variables such as age, gender, socio-economic level and developmental areas such as social, cognitive and physical can be examined.

## Acknowledgements or Notes

This study is derived from a project supported by TÜBİTAK (1059B191600044).

## References

- Acat, M. B., & Aslan, M. (2012). Yeni bir değer sınıflaması ve bu sınıflamaya bağlı olarak öğrencilere kazandırılması gereken değerler [A new value classification and the values that should be gained to students depending on this classification]. *Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice*, 12(2), 1461-1474.
- Akin, T. (1995). *Character education in America's school*. Spring Valley, CA.: Innerchoice Publishing.
- Aspin, D. N. (2000). Values, beliefs and attitudes in education: The nature of values and their place and promotion in schools. *Education, Culture and Values*, 14, 197-218.
- Aydın, M. Z., & Akyol-Gürler, Ş. (2013). *Okulda değerler eğitimi yöntem-etkinlikler kaynaklar* [Values education method-activities at school resources]. Ankara: Nobel. Bacanlı, H. (2011). Değer değer midir? [Is value worth?]. *Eğitime Bakış*, 7(19), 18-21.

- Balat, G. U., & Dağal, A. B. (2009). *Okul öncesi dönemde değerler eğitimi*. Ankara: Kök Yayıncılık.
- Berman, S. H. (1998). The bridge to civility: Empathy, ethics, and service. *School Administrator*, 55(5), 27-32.
- Bursa, S., & Çengelci -Köse, T. (2017). Comparison of Turkish and Canadian social studies curricula in terms of values education. *Anadolu Journal of Educational Sciences International*, 7(2), 338-372. Doi: 10.18039/ajesi.333738
- Çetingöz, D. (2015). Okul öncesi eğitimi öğretmen adaylarının değerler eğitiminde öğretmenin rolüne ilişkin görüşleri [Pre-school prospective teachers' views regarding the teacher role in value education]. *TSA*, 19, 33-52.
- Cooper, D. (2014). *Character education: a study of an elementary school leadership academy*. Wilmington University (Delaware).
- Cüceloğlu, D. (1998). *İnsan ve davranışı: psikolojinin temel kavramları* [Human and behavior: basic concepts of psychology]. İstanbul: Remzi Kitapevi.
- Dede, Y. (2014). A comparison of Turkish and German mathematics teachers' values: A gender perspective. *Education and Science*, 39(171), 180-198.
- Dewey, J. (2013). *The school and society and the child and the curriculum*. University of Chicago Press.
- Dilek, H., & Duman, T. (2014) 2006 Okul Öncesi Eğitim Programının değerlendirilmesi [Evaluation of the 2006 pre-school education program]. *Gazi Üniversitesi Endüstriyel Sanatlar Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 33, 143-158.
- Doğanay, A. (2007). *Değerler eğitimi* [Values education]. In C. Öztürk (Ed.), *Hayat bilgisi ve sosyal bilgiler öğretimi yapılandırıcı bir yaklaşım* [A constructivist approach to life science and social studies teaching] (pp. 255-286). Ankara: Pegem-A Yayıncılık.
- Early Childhood Ohio (2017). *Ohio's early childhood system*. Retrieved from <http://www.earlychildhoodohio.org/Ohios-Early-Childhood-System.stm>.
- Ekşi, H., & Katılmış, A. (2011). Değerler eğitimi yaklaşımları. *Diyanet Dergisi*, 245, 1- 3.
- Elias, M. (2009). Social-emotional and character development and academics as a dual focus of educational policy. *Educational Policy*, 23(6), 831-846.
- Fixler, B. (2000). A caring and sharing environment helps teach values kindergarten students, *ED 445781*. Retrieved from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED445781.pdf>.
- Gelişli, Y., & Yazıcı, E. (2012). *Türkiye'de uygulanan okul öncesi eğitim programlarının tarihsel süreç içerisinde değerlendirilmesi* [The evaluation of preschool educational programs applied in Turkey within historical process]. *Gazi Üniversitesi Endüstriyel Sanatlar Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 29, 85-93.
- Gömlüksiz, M. N. (2007). Lise öğrencilerinin toplumsal değerlere ilişkin tutumları: Elazığ ili örneği. Kaymakcan, S. Kenan, H. Hökelekli, Z. Ş. Arslan, M. Zengin (Ed.) *Değerler ve eğitimi içinde* (s. 727-741). İstanbul: Değerler Eğitimi Merkezi Yayınları.
- Gürhan, E. (2017). *The evaluation of values education applications carried out in primary schools according to the views of school administrator and class teachers: The Example of Selçuklu-Konya*. (Unpublished master thesis). Necmettin Erbakan University, Konya.
- Halstead, J. M., & Pike, M. A. (2006). *Citizenship and moral education: Values in action*. Cornwall: Routledge.
- Harlin, R., & Morgan, H. (2009). Review of research: Gender, racial and ethnic misrepresentation in children's books: A comparative look. *Childhood Education*, 85(3), 187-190.
- Hildebrandt, C., & Zan, B. (2014). *Constructivist approaches to moral education in early childhood*. In L. P. Nucci ve P. Narvaez (Eds.) *Handbook of moral and character education* (pp. 196-213). New York: Routledge.
- Johansson, E., Cobb-Moore, C., Lunn-Brownlee, J., Walker, S., Boulton-Lewis, G., & Ailwood, J. (2014). Children's perspectives on values and rules in Australian early education. *Australasian Journal of Early Childhood*, 39(2), 12-20.
- Josephson, M. S., & Hanson, W. (2002). *Making ethical decisions* (pp. 27-29). Marina del Rey, CA: Josephson Institute of Ethics.
- Kandır, A., Özbey, S., & İnal, G. (2010). A study on the difficulties faced by preschool teachers in the planning and implementation. *The Journal of International Social Research*, 2(6), 373-387.
- Kesgin, S. (2015). Amerika Birleşik Devletleri'ndeki karakter eğitimi programları üzerine bir değerlendirme (Georgia ve Florida Örneği). *Değerler Eğitimi Dergisi*, 13(29), 117-148.
- Komalasari, K., & Saripudin, D. (2017). Value-based interactive multimedia development through integrated practice for the formation of students' character. *Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology-TOJET*, 16(4), 179-186.
- Lickona, T. & Davidson, M. (2005). *A report to the nation smart & good high schools integrating excellence and ethics for success in school, work, and beyond, center for the 4th and 5th rs (Respect and Responsibility) State University of New York College at Cortland*. Retrieved from <https://www2.cortland.edu/centers/character/high-schools/SnGReport.pdf>



- Lickona, T. (1996). Eleven principles of effective character education. *Journal of Moral Education*, 25(1), 93-100.
- Lovat, T. J., & Clement, N. D. (2008). The pedagogical imperative of values education. *Journal of Beliefs & Values Studies in Religion & Education* 29(3), 273-285.
- Melhuish, E. C. (2011). Preschool matters. *Science*, 333(6040), 299-300. doi: 10.1126/science.1209459
- MNE (2013). *Republic of Turkey Ministry of National Education, early childhood curriculum*. Retrieved from <https://tegm.MNE.gov.tr/dosya/okuloncesi/ooproram.pdf>.
- MNE (2017). *Republic of Turkey Ministry of National Education, objectives of the curriculum*. Retrieved from <http://mufredat.MNE.gov.tr/ProgramDetay.aspx?PID=332Melhuish>
- MNE (1994). *Okul öncesi eğitim programları*, İstanbul: Milli Eğitim Basımevi.
- NAEYC, (2018). *The national association for the education of young children*. Retrieved from <https://www.naeyc.org/>
- Ogelman, G. H., & Sarıkaya, E. H. (2015). Okul öncesi eğitimi öğretmenlerinin değerler eğitimi konusundaki görüşleri: Denizli ili örneği. *Sakarya Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 29, 81-100.
- Ohio Department of Education (2017). *Birth through kindergarten entry implementation guides*. Retrieved from [http://education.ohio.gov/Topics/Early-Learning/Early-Learning-Content-Standards/Birth-Through-Pre\\_K-Learning-and-Development-Stand/Birth-Through-Pre\\_K-Implementation-Guides](http://education.ohio.gov/Topics/Early-Learning/Early-Learning-Content-Standards/Birth-Through-Pre_K-Learning-and-Development-Stand/Birth-Through-Pre_K-Implementation-Guides)
- Pekdoğan, S. (2017). Values education programs at America in childhood. *Hitit University Journal of Social Sciences Institute*, 10(1), 503-520.
- Piaget, J. (2002). *Judgement and reasoning in the child*. Routledge.
- Recchia, S. L., & Beck, L. M. (2014). Reflective practice as “enrichment”: How new early childhood teachers enact preservice values in their classrooms. *Journal of Early Childhood Teacher Education*, 35(3), 203-225.
- Reynolds, A. J., Temple, J. A., Ou, S. R., Arteaga, I. A., & White, B. A. (2011). School-based early childhood education and age-28 well-being: Effects by timing, dosage, and subgroups. *Science*, 333(6040), 360-364.
- Rokeach, M., & Regan J. F. (1980) The role of values in the counseling situation. *The Personnel and Guidance Journal* 58(9), 576–582..
- Ryan, K., & Bohlin, K. E. (1999). *Building character in schools practical ways to bring moral instruction to life*. Jossey-Bass Publisher, San Francisco.
- Sapsağlam, Ö. (2016). Examination of targets in preschool education programs in terms of values. *Electronic Turkish Studies*, 11(9). 683-700. doi:10.7827/TurkishStudies.9571
- Schwartz, S. H. (1999). A Theory of cultural values and some implications for work. *Applied Psychology*, 48(1) 23-47.
- Schwartz, M. (Ed.). (2007). *Effective character education: A guidebook for future teachers*. NY: McGrawHill.
- Schwartz, S. H. (2012). An overview of the Schwartz theory of basic values. *Online Readings in Psychology and Culture*, 2(1), <http://dx.doi.org/10.9707/2307-0919.1116>.
- Schwartz, S. H. & Saving, L. (1995). Identifying culture-specific in the content and structure of values. *Journal Cross-Cultural Psychology*, 26, 92-116.
- Sigurdardottir I., & Einarsdottir, J. (2016). An action research study in an Icelandic preschool: Developing consensus about values and values education. *International Journal of Early Childhood*, 48(2), 161-177.
- Thornberg, R., & Oğuz, E. (2013). Teachers’ views on values education: A qualitative study in Sweden and Turkey. *International Journal of Educational Research*, 59, 49–56.
- Thornberg, R. (2016). Values education in Nordic preschools: A commentary. *International Journal of Early Childhood*, 48(2), 241–257.
- Trout, N. J. (2008). *Building character education in the preschool*. (Doctoral dissertation). Capella University.
- Turan, İ. (2014). Karakter eğitimi: Amerika örneği. *Marife Dini Araştırmalar Dergisi*, 14(1), 75-92.
- UNESCO, (2012). *Living values education overview*. Retrieved from <http://www.livingvalues.net/index.html>.
- US Department of Education. (2003) *Values-helping your child through early adolescence*. Retrieved from <https://www2.ed.gov/parents/academic/help/adolescence/partx5.html>
- US Department of Education (2018). *What does 'strong character' mean?-Helping your child become a responsible citizen*. Retrieved from <https://www2.ed.gov/parents/academic/help/citizen/part4.html>
- Watz, M. (2011). An historical analysis of character education. *Journal of Inquiry and Action in Education*, 4(2), 34-53.
- Yıldırım, A., & Şimşek, H. (2006). *Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri* [Qualitative research methods in the social sciences]. Ankara: SeçkinYayınevi.
- Zajda, J., & Daun, H. (Eds.). (2009). *Global values education: Teaching democracy and peace*. Dordrecht: Springer.